9-25-2012

Reinforcing the Tower of Babel: The Impact of Copyright Law on Fansubbing

LaToya D. Rembert-Lang
American University Washington College of Law

Follow this and additional works at: http://digitalcommons.wcl.american.edu/ipbrief

Part of the Intellectual Property Commons

Recommended Citation

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Washington College of Law Journals & Law Reviews at Digital Commons @ American University Washington College of Law. It has been accepted for inclusion in Intellectual Property Brief by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons @ American University Washington College of Law. For more information, please contact fbrown@wcl.american.edu.
Reinforcing the Tower of Babel: The Impact of Copyright Law on Fansubbing

**Keywords**
translations, copyright law

This article is available in Intellectual Property Brief: http://digitalcommons.wcl.american.edu/ipbrief/vol2/iss2/3
I. Introduction

Everyone has ingrained in their memory one line of dialogue from a television program or movie that they consider as their favorite and will remember for the rest of their lives. For me, no line has seemed to eclipse: “There’s no such thing in this world as a perfect man and a perfect woman, just a perfect love built together by an imperfect man and imperfect woman.” This line of dialogue was not spoken in any American television program or movie, but rather, in a Korean television drama. Through the proliferation of “fansubbing,” I was able to experience and reflect on the dialogue that I now consider as one of my favorite lines of all time. This cross-cultural experience transformed my perception of world culture and broadened my horizons into a whole new realm of media and entertainment.

I am not alone in my cross-cultural experience. Chinese fans transfixed by American television shows such as “Lost” and “C.S.I.,” download the American television programs and create Chinese fansub translations in order to experience another world view on entertainment. Copyright law, however, threatens to distort the ability to have such a cross-cultural experience. Enforcement and illegalities established in copyright law negate the ability for individuals to have multicultural viewing experiences in foreign television programs and movies worldwide in a limited market or where no market is being exploited.

This comment examines fansubbing and the implications that copyright law has on its efforts as an endeavor. Part II provides an overview of fansubbing, its practice and its ethos. Part III discusses translations as a copyrighted work, including the history and development under copyright law. Part IV analyzes the complexities of fansubbing practices under existing copyright law through legal analysis and how the doctrine of fair use can be utilized to protect fansubbing practices under copyright law. Part V discusses access to foreign television programs and movies, the cultural benefits of exposure to foreign works, technology implications on fansubbing, and suggests a model for reforming the perception of fansubbing. Part VI provides in closing that copyright law protects the needs of artists, but does little to protect the needs of consumers. Consumers desire fan-based activities and need exposure and access to other views and dimensions on world culture. Existing copyright law limits the progression of societal access to foreign television programs and movies through fansubbing activities.

II. The Fansubbing Phenomenon

Fan culture appears in different mediums of expression. Among the most noted and recognized in fan culture is fanfiction. At the opposing end of the fan culture genre is fansubbing. Fansubbing, otherwise known as fan-subtitled, is defined primarily as “an unauthorized translation . . . in the form of subtitles.” The definition, however, as it appears on many websites of fansub groups is “a video . . . subtitled by fans.” There are two main styles of fansub translations: softsubs and hardsubs.

Softsubs are simple text files “whose format depends on the exact subtitle encoding software to

---

1. LaToya D. Rembert-Lang, J.D. is a 2010 Master of Laws candidate in the Law and Government program at American University's Washington College of Law. She received her J.D. from the University of Cincinnati College of Law and a B.A. in Political Science from the University of Cincinnati.
4. This comment will use the term “artist”, which includes references to authors and copyright owners.
5. See Rebecca Tushnet, Payment in Credit: Copyright Law and Subcultural Creativity, 70 SPG Law & Contemp. Probs. 135 (2007).
6. See id. at 140. Fanfictions are “fan-created stories and artwork focusing on the relationship between the main characters.”
be used for [interpretation].” \(^{10}\) They are not encoded in the video stream of a television program or movie and as a result they can be turned on or off and edited based on preferences. \(^{11}\) Softsubs are often in plain text form and only provide a translation of the program or the movie. Hardsubs are “video containers where subtitles have been encoded into the video stream.” \(^{12}\) The hardsub format will often have graphic fonts that change color to reflect the opening and closing credits, dialogue of different characters, song lyrics and cultural context.

The practice of fansubbing is conducted by either an individual, a group of individuals collectively known as fansub groups, \(^{13}\) or through community translations teams. Fansub groups are composed of persons who work together focused on the translation of one language for multiple foreign television programs and movies. Fansub groups recruit staff composed of volunteers who serve in various roles as either: “Coordinators,” “Translators,” “Timers,” “Editors,” and “Spot Translators.” \(^{14}\) A community translation team offers the opportunity for any individual to assist with providing translations and is formed based around a common interest in a specific television program or movie. An individual can assist with contributions to either add translations or to improve upon existing translations to a television program or movie. Community translation teams also work with an individual or team, designated as the Moderator, over a channel for a specified television program or movie in order to police what fansub translations are provided. Additional persons on community translation teams, known as Segmenters, provide proper fansub translation timings to the dialogue provided in the television program or movie. In community translations, unlike fansub groups, fans who view the television program or movie are often invited to provide a running commentary and interactive dialogue on the work. \(^{15}\)

The fansubbing process is intense. At least eleven critical steps must occur before a final version of either the television program or movie is released. These steps include: “(1) Raw acquisition,” “(2) Translation,” “(3) Rough Timing,” “(4) Edit,” “(5) Fine Timing,” “(6) Translation check,” “(7) Typesetting,” “(8) Quality Control,” “(9) Encoding,” “(10) Distribution,” and “(11) Release.” \(^{16}\) The amount of prep time for each step can range from a few hours to up to twelve hours depending on the role and task. \(^{17}\)

**A. The Fansubbing Ethos**

“Fansub[translations] are made for fans, by fans, and not for commercial purposes.” \(^{18}\) No profits are involved in fansubbing. \(^{19}\) Many fansub translations boldly display within the translated text of the television program or movie that it is not for sale. Selling fansub translations is frowned upon in the fansubbing community and is considered bootlegging. \(^{20}\)

There are, however, live streaming websites and torrent sites that have fansub translations of television programs and movies and accept donations as gifts for running their websites. \(^{21}\)

The inherent goal in fansubbing is to get access

---

12. *Id.*
13. The use of the term “fansub group” will also include references to the categories of individuals conducting fansub translations and community translation teams, where explicit mentions of both categories are not provided.
and increase exposure to unlicensed foreign television programs and movies. The majority of fansubbers only work with unlicensed foreign television programs and movies that have not aired in their native country. Fansubbers understand that once licensing occurs, the distribution of the fansub translations for the television program or movie will cease. Once a domestic company licenses a title, fansubbers request that all previous distributions of the fansub translations for the foreign television program or movie cease, be destroyed and permanently deleted, and if they enjoyed the television program or movie to go out and buy it. Exceptions are made, however, to continue the fansub translation if the licensed product will be heavily edited or localized.

The fansubbing process for distribution has occurred in various formats over the years. Present technology for fansub distribution occurs through a process known as digisubbing. A digisub, known otherwise as a “digital fansub,” is an “unauthorized translation . . . in the form of a subtitled digital video, usually distributed over a computer network in the form of a DivX-coded avi-file.” Digisubs are distributed through either BitTorrent or Internet Relay Chat Direct Client Connection (IRC DCC) servers.

There is a discord among fansub groups over the use of digisubs. The ability of fansub groups to create of cheap, high quality digital subs, which are produced by some fansub groups, leads many to feel that there is no incentive to purchase a licensed copy of the television program or movie, if available.

Understanding the basics of fansubbing are important; yet, the principles surrounding rights and protection to the translation of works have cultivated a perception that has contributed to the current dynamic for fansubbing practices in copyright law.

III. The Lost and Found in Translation

The first known work subject to any form of translation was the Bible, which was translated in 1522. Prior to 1886 there was no formal copyright protection for the rights of artists, including rights to translations of their works. The implementation of the Berne Convention for the Protection of Literary and Artistic Works (Berne Convention) in 1886 defined the rights artists had to their translations. The 1908 amendment of the Berne Convention formally included the right of translation in the reproduction right. Article 8 of the Berne Convention expressly provides: “Artists of literary and artistic works . . . shall enjoy the exclusive right of making and of authorizing the translation of their works throughout the term of protection of their rights in original works.”

Literary and artistic works is expansively defined under the Berne Convention. Early copyright law in Europe and the United States did not adopt the international interpretation on the rights of artists and did not

23. Id.
25. Bloomsburg University Manga and Anime Club, supra note 11. Localized is a concept that will be discussed in Part IV of this comment.
26. Fansubbing distribution began with Anime and occurred by copying episodes on videotapes in low quality formats. Early fansubbers would rely on local residents to record and send copies of various anime on VHS tapes to various anime clubs. The anime clubs would provide fansub translations of the anime on VHS tapes and then provide them to fansub distributors which would sell them to fans. VHS quality was poor, expensive and difficult to reproduce. Fansubbing distribution evolved with the creation of the computer and the ability to use “high speed Internet access, desktop video editing and DVD ripping.” The modern process for fansub distribution is now almost exclusively done by digisubbing.

29. Id.
30. See Bloomsburg University Manga and Anime Club, supra note 9.
31. Id. Digisubbing can produce HD quality sub translations, which in appearance are equivalent as the original television shows or movies.
34. Berne Convention, supra note 33, Ketzan, supra note 32 at 209.
35. Berne Convention, supra note 33.
36. Id. (stating that literary and artistic works includes "dramatic or dramatico-musical works; choreographic works and entertainments in dumb show; musical compositions with or without words; cinematographic works . . . works of drawing, painting, architecture, sculpture, engraving and lithography; photographic works. . . . works of applied art; illustrations, maps, plans, sketches and three-dimensional works relative to geography, topography, architecture or science."
provide translation rights.

Early European copyright law during the eighteenth and nineteenth century permitted translations of artists' works without any formal permission requirements on use. 37 Case law supported the right, and the ability, to make translations of artists' works. In the English Chancery court case of Burnett v. Chetwood, the court held that the publication of a translation under the then current copyright statute, the Statute of Anne, was not unlawful. 38 In the King's Bench case of Millar v. Taylor, the court recognized the translation of a work is a separate entity that specifically creates a new work. 39 Artists were not granted rights in translations of their works in the United Kingdom until the Copyright Act 1911. 40 Early copyright law in the United States shared the original English interpretation that the translation right in an artist's work was a separate entity, essentially creating a new work. The case of Stowe v. Thomas held the translation of "Uncle Tom's Cabin" was not a copy under copyright law, and no infringement was found. 41 The perception that translations were not infringements on copyrights, however, would not remain. In the Copyright Act of 1870, Congress explicitly overturned the Stowe ruling by providing that "[a]uthors may reserve the right to dramatize or to translate their own works." 42 This right was further enhanced under the Copyright Act of 1909. 43 Under the current copyright law, the Copyright Act of 1976, an author's right to translation now has protection as a "derivative work." 44

The historical interpretation of translation rights for artists shifted from valuing the labor and effort expended in providing translations, to an enhancement of statutory protection for an artist's exclusive right to translate their works. This new form of protection for artists lacks a perception of a proper balance between protecting artists' rights and recognizing the social value of translations for certain works. Consideration of balancing test between the translation rights of artists and the social value of translations is needed to comprehend the role and importance of fansubbing.

IV. CHALLENGING THE LEGALITIES OF COPYRIGHT

Under existing copyright law, fansubbing is illegal and viewed as "illicit access to art without properly compensating artists," 45 because many individuals view fansubs without ever purchasing the work of the author. If the work is never licensed, the artist never receives any profit from viewing the work. Some fansub groups have acknowledged it is illegal. 46 Within the first few hours of airing, fans download the television program or movie, and have begun the translating process for public distribution worldwide. Fansubbing is a violation of both International and United States copyright law. 47

A. The International Perspective

Laws governing international copyright law include: The Berne Convention, as discussed in Part III, 48 the Uruguay Round Agreements Act

37. Id.
38. 35 Eng. Rep. 1008-9 (1721). In an interesting form of dicta, the court noted the time and commitment involved in translating a work by stating: "[i]f though a translation might not be the same with the reprinting of the original, on account that the translator has bestowed his care and pains upon it, and so [is] not within the prohibition of the act. . . ." Id.
39. 98 Eng. Rep. 201, 201 (via Ketzan) (1769) (explicitly providing that "certainly bona fide imitations, translations, and abridgements are different; and in respect of the property, may be considered as new works: but colourable and fraudulent variations will not do.").
40. Copyright Act, 1911, I&2 Geo.V., c. 46.
41. 23 F. Cas. 201 (C.C.E.D.Pa. 1853). Harriet Beecher Stowe, as author, brought a claim for infringement against a publisher for an unauthorized German translation of her work, "Uncle Tom's Cabin." The court stated: "The claim of literary property, therefore, after publication, cannot be in the ideas, sentiments, or the creations, of the imagination of the poet or novelist as disserved from the language, idiom, style, or the outward semblance and exhibition of them. His exclusive property in the creation of his mind, cannot be vested in the author as abstractions, but only in the concrete form which he has given them, and the language in which he has clothe them." Id.
42. Copyright Act of 1870, § 86 16 Stat. 198 (1870).
43. Copyright Act of 1909, §1(b) 35 Stat. 1075 (1909). ("To translate the copyrighted work into other languages or dialects, or make any other version thereof, if it be a literary work . . .")
44. Copyright Act of 1976, Pub. L. 94-553, §102, 90 Stat. 2541 (encompassing §103: "The subject matter of copyright as specified by Section 102 includes compilations and derivative works. . . ." A "derivative work" is defined as "a work based upon one or more preexisting works, such as a translation . . .").
47. See, e.g. Copyright Act of 1976 at §102. See also Berne Convention, supra note 33. The original work of authors is taken and translated in their entirety by fansub groups without deference to the author's translation rights.
48. Berne Convention, supra note 33.
(URAA),\textsuperscript{49} and the Universal Copyright Convention (UCC).\textsuperscript{50} The Berne Convention and the URAA require copyright protection of a copyrighted work to be extended within a party state or provided to a party national of a state.\textsuperscript{51} Article V of the UCC explicitly declares the right of translation to artists by stating: “[c]opyright shall include the exclusive right of the author to make, publish, and authorize the making and publication of translations of works.”\textsuperscript{52} Beyond translation rights, international laws provide a type of protection that is available only in a limited respect in the United States - moral rights.

Moral rights consist of a “bundle of rights,”\textsuperscript{53} with the most central rights being attribution and integrity.\textsuperscript{54} Attribution is the right to claim authorship in a work\textsuperscript{55} and “[t]he right to prevent others from falsely attributing to him the authorship of a work that he has not in fact written.”\textsuperscript{56} Integrity is defined as the artist’s right “to prevent any deforming or mutilating changes to his work”;\textsuperscript{57} the public presentation of which would “injure [the author’s] honor or reputation.”\textsuperscript{58} Moral rights were included in the Berne Convention in 1928.\textsuperscript{59}

International law enhances the challenges of fansubbers. Authors have significant rights and protection to control the creation of translations for their works. The rights of artists to control the quality and appearance of translations of their works should not diminish. International law, however, provides artists the ability to impose significant time delays in making a determination whether a work will be translated, particularly in the areas of television programs and movies. As a result, the translation rights of artists should be limited in scope depending on the type of work that is created.

\textbf{B. The United States Perspective}

Under copyright law an artist’s rights are violated when one commits an act of copyright infringement. In order for an artist to succeed on a copyright infringement claim in the United States, the artist must prove: (1) the ownership of a valid copyright, (2) an unauthorized copy of the work, and (3) the allegedly infringed work is substantially similar to the work.\textsuperscript{60} A “derivative work” is defined as “a work based upon one or more preexisting works, such as a translation.”\textsuperscript{61} For infringement, a “derivative work must be based upon a copyrighted work.”\textsuperscript{62} Similar to the Berne Convention, United States copyright law provides limited moral rights protection under the Visual Artists Rights Act of 1990 (VARA).\textsuperscript{63} Under VARA, the rights of attribution and integrity are applied only to works of visual art.\textsuperscript{64} Moral rights in the United States are limited to protect only works of visual art. Fansub translations are not considered a work of visual art and are not entitled to protection under moral rights. As a result, United States copyright law protects an artist’s right to prevent fansub translations of their works based on the derivative works right. The doctrine of fair use is used as a defense to copyright infringement. As described in Title 17 of the Copyright Act of 1976, an infringing use is considered “fair use” if the work is


\textsuperscript{51} Sean Kirkpatrick, Like Holding a Bird: What the Prevalence of Fansubbing Can Teach Us About the Use of Strategic Selective Copyright Enforcement, 21 TEMP. ENVTL. L. & TECH. J. 131, 137-138 (2006).

\textsuperscript{52} Universal Copyright Convention, supra note 52.


\textsuperscript{54} Spangler, supra note 55, at 1302.

\textsuperscript{55} Id.


\textsuperscript{57} Spangler, supra note 55, at 1302 (quoting Carter v. Helmsley-Spear, Inc., 71 F.3d 77, 81 (2d Cir. 1995)).

\textsuperscript{58} Spangler, supra note 55, at 1302 (quoting Brian T. McCartney, “Creepings” and “Glimmers” of Moral Rights of Artists in American Copyright Law, 6 UCLA ENT. L. REV. 35, 38 (1998)).

\textsuperscript{59} Berne Convention, supra note 33. Article 6bis provides: “Independently of an author’s economic rights, and even after the transfer of said rights, the author shall have the right to claim authorship of the work and to object to any distortion, mutilation, or other modification of, or other derogatory action in relation to, the said work, which would be prejudicial to his honor or reputation.”


\textsuperscript{64} See id; See also Joshua M. Daniels “Lost in Translation”: Anime, Moral Rights, and Market Failure, 88 B.U. L. Rev. 709, 716-718 (2008).
used for “criticism, comment, news reporting, teaching . . . scholarship, or research . . .” Factors examined to determine whether fair use is appropriate include:

1. examining factor one: purpose and character of the work

In Sony Corp. v. Universal City Studios, Inc., the Supreme Court held that it is presumptively unfair “to make copies for a commercial or profitmaking purpose.” The Court further expounded, in Harper & Row, Publishers, Inc. v. Nation Enterprises, that commercialism is a “separate factor that tends to weigh against a finding of fair use.” In Campbell v. Acuff-Rose Music, Inc., the Court added the additional element to the first factor of fair use by examining the transformative nature of the new work.

In applying the first factor of fair use to fansubbing, according to the fansubbing ethos, fansub translations are not commercial in nature. As stated in Part II, distribution of fansub translations are free and often provide notice that the fansub translations are not to be sold or used for any commercial purpose. Due to the nature of fansub translations, commercialism is not a concern. Therefore, analyzing the first factor of fair use relies on determining whether fansub translations are transformative in nature.

Language translations are composed of multiple interpretations and styles. While there are no steadfast rules as to what type of translation should be used for any given text, different forms can be chosen based on the following: “the purpose of the translation, the translation team itself, [and] the receptor language audience for whom the translation is intended.” Language translations are either “literal translations” which translate the forms “the grammatical and lexical forms of the source language”, or in the case of fansub translations, “idiomatic translations,” which focus on the communication of the source language in a natural way or through slang for the subbing audience. The “idiomatic translations” style of fansub translations can create a translation that is a transformative work of its own. This potential transformative nature of fansub translations requires that fansub translations should be examined on a case-by-case basis, rather than generalizing the genre as infringing activity. A majority of fansub groups offer more than dialogue translation to provide cultural and language reference notes in the fansub translations. Within television program or movies, references are provided to explain the context

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Note</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>66.</td>
<td>Id.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>69.</td>
<td>510 U.S. 569, 579 (1994) (“The central purpose of this investigation is to see . . . whether the new work merely ‘supersed[e]’ the objects’ of the original creation, or instead adds something new, with further purpose or different character, altering the first with new expression, meaning or message; it asks in other words, whether and to what extent the new work is ‘transformative’. ”).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70.</td>
<td>See Bloomsburg University Manga and Anime Club, supra note 11.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>71.</td>
<td>Id.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>73.</td>
<td>Id.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>74.</td>
<td>Id.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75.</td>
<td>Wang Song, U.S. TV Dramas Hot in China, Chinatoday, March 2008, <a href="http://www.tominchina.com/main/archives/17">http://www.tominchina.com/main/archives/17</a> (last visited October 14, 2010, link no longer active) (stating that, in China, there are presently three main fansub groups where “unlike standard professional translations which are blunt in expression, the versions by the subtitling groups are full of the flavor of life. They use everyday expressions and local idioms . . . . They also usually add some annotation to the dialogue, explaining cultural references like the names of American celebrities.”).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
of certain dialogue, attractions and venues, or provide an expanded reference to a general colloquialism that is frequently used within the local culture or community.77 Fansubs translations that include reference and context should be recognized as having a transformative nature.

a. Cultural and Educational Benefits of Exposure

The first factor of fair use also provides a defense when the use is for “nonprofit educational purposes.”78 To reinforce the non-commercial element, fansubs translations are nonprofit.79 Moreover, beyond its appeal as a form of entertainment, exposure to television programs and movies is educational. The learning process by viewing television programs and movies is informal, but effective.80 Television programs provide an informal explicit learning setting where one can learn about “love, sex and relationships.”81 Educational opportunities from viewing foreign television shows and movie assist with learning the language by “[improving one’s] listening skills,”82 “[picking] up vocabulary and colloquial phrases”83 and allowing an individual to “immerse [themselves] in a language.”84 Viewers are able to learn cultural norms and values and discover the importance of daily interaction with respect to relationships.85 As an example, when viewing Japanese television programs, one can learn of socio-economic status and their relationships by examining the role of Bento boxes.86

Viewing foreign television programs and movies can also improve diplomatic relationships and influence the creation of new works.87 The Korean wave of programs has helped fuel relationships with Japan with an emphasis on tourism and relationships.88 Japanese television programs have influenced Hong Kong television programs in terms of “story and plot, music, photography, [and] dialogue.”89 Taiwanese television programs are influenced by Western culture and other parts of Asia.90

Insight into other cultures, languages and experiences provide opportunities for educational learning opportunities, and should also be considered when examining the first factor analysis of a fair use defense in favor of fansub translations. The transformative nature and the educational value of foreign television programs and movies should warrant a closer examination of its application to the first factor analysis of fair use to determine its relevance in United States copyright law.

2. Examining Factor Two: The Nature of the Copyrighted Work

The second factor of a fair use analysis is the nature of a copyrighted work.91 In examining the nature of a copyrighted work, courts have considered: “(1) the scope of originality of the work; (2) the informative nature of the work; (3) the intended use of the original and the copy; (4) the availability of the work; and (5) whether the work is published or unpublished.”92 A work is considered original if it is “independently created by the author [and] possesses at least some minimal degree of creativity.”93 The Supreme Court provides that creative works “are closer to the core of intended copyright protection.”94 A creative work is protected under copyright law if it exists in tangible form and meets the minimal threshold requirement for creativity.95

79. See WithS2, supra note 9.
81. Id.
83. Id.
84. Id.
85. Huei, supra note 83.
88. Id.
90. Huei Lan Wang, supra note 83.
92. Scott M. Martin, Jonathan Zavin, Photocopying and the Doctrine of Fair Use Under the Copyright Act, 317 PLI/Pat 601, 609-610 (1991) (discussing the courts various interpretations of the second fair use factor).
95. See 17 U.S.C., §102(a) (2006) (providing that “[c]opyright protection subsists . . . in original works of authorship fixed in any
Since creative works receive copyright protection, the use of creative works will be scrutinized against the fair use doctrine. The creativity of television programs and movies, as tangible creations made by artists, meet the minimum threshold requirements to receive protection as creative works. An analysis of whether a work is creative does not resolve an examination of the second fair use factor; a consideration of access to the creative work must also be applied. Access to foreign television programs and movies are limited in the market. Due to market access limitations, the fansub translations of this creative work should receive some form of consideration under the fair use doctrine.

The goal in fansubbing is to bring awareness to, and get licensing for, various foreign television programs and movies. Fansub groups also desire to “include programs that are commercially unviable.” Commercial viability is based in large part on the production year, market appeal, and the timing component in waiting to have access to the television program or movie. Unless an individual is located in a particular country and/or understands the language of a country, it is very difficult to obtain access to, or become aware of, what television programs or movies are airing in the region without some assistance. As a result of these geographical and linguistic obstacles, access to foreign television programs and movies usually occurs in one of three formats: VCDs, DVDs or the Internet.

Access to foreign television programs and movies are also limited by the process of localization. Through localization—a process of censorship, visual transformations of the foreign work, and/or dubbing—access to the original creative work is limited. The lost access to the original creative work also serves as a catalyst for fansubbing.

As a creative work, foreign television programs and movies are entitled to copyright protection. The scope of the protection and use of creative works should be as analyzed in accordance to market access under the fair use doctrine. Fansubbing provides an opportunity to view creative works of limited access and warrants further review under copyright law.

3. Examining Factor Three: Amount and Substantiality of the Portion Used

The Supreme Court expounded upon the third factor as an examination of “the quantity and value of the materials used” as a test of reasonableness in purpose and relation to the copying done. Fansub groups copy the original work in its entirety. The type and quality of the fansub translations can range depending on where the television program or movie is obtained, but the full embodiment of the original work is still produced. Despite the use of the entire work, fansub groups have a distinct argument for copying the work for reasonableness purposes. The intent behind copying the entire work is for the express purpose of subtitling the original work into another language that was not provided in the original work. Fansub translations for a foreign television program or movie cannot occur without full access to the original work. For that reason, the quantity of material used and the extent of copying of that material is reasonable in light of the intended use of translation.

4. Examining Factor Four: Effect of the Use Upon the Market

The Court in Harper declared that the fourth factor, “effect of the use upon the potential market for or value of the copyrighted work,” is the “single most important element of fair use.” This factor considers the original and derivative works in the context of the potential harm to the market, and also “whether unrestricted and widespread conduct . . . would result in a substantially adverse impact on the potential market.”

The market effect of fansub translations can be examined from a variety of perspectives. Viewing each perspective as the total correlation of the market may shed some light on the role and impact of fansub translations versus licensed foreign television programs and movies in the market. The analysis for analyzing market effect requires an understanding of the market’s

---

96. See id.
97. See Astronerdboy, supra note 22.
99. Id.
100. Wang Song, supra note 78.
103. Id. at 586.
104. Id.
105. Id. at 585 (quoting Nimmer §13.05[A][4]).
impact on the local country of origin of the work, the
factors impacting the marketing and development of a
licensed television program or movie, and the factors
affecting the fansub translation itself.

First, the impact on the market from a local
perspective, where the television program or movie
originally airs, must be examined. Fansub groups
obtain a large portion of television shows and
movies through local broadcasts. Local broadcasts
display commercial advertisements during each
episode. Fansub groups will often remove the
commercial advertisements from the television
programs and movies. Production costs of foreign
television programs and movies are extensive and
impact the overall budgets of producers based on
sponsorship opportunities. For example, in South
Korea, advertisers and producers work together on
product placements in television programs through
sponsorships. If a sponsor is not happy with product
placements, producers are required to pay a penalty.
Similarly, in Japan, sponsorship is a prominent aspect
of all television programs. The names of the sponsors
appear throughout the airing of each television
program. Removing commercial advertisements can
cause harm to the local market. Due to the high
production costs of producing television programs
and movies, sponsors may have a reduced incentive
to produce commercial advertisements if the local
viewership market is limited and fansub groups
remove the opportunity for exposure abroad, even if
it the product or service is not accessible in a foreign
market. The reduced incentives and increased costs
of foreign television programs and movies can impact
development, future distribution and access.

Second, from a worldwide consumer perspective,
the market is based on the creation of licensed
television programs and movies. Since the current
market of available foreign licensed television programs
and movies are limited, the question becomes what
information is used to determine which particular

Third, the overall quality of a fansub translation
versus the overall quality of a translation of a licensed
television program or movie also has an impact on
the market and its direct implications to licensed versions
of the work. Factors used to compare the quality
between a fansub translation and licensed television
program or movie translation includes: miscellaneous
features, localization, “type/quality of translation,”
subbing techniques and style, “sound work,” “picture
quality,” and timing of release. Each factor supports
the notion that fansub groups are in competition with
other fansub groups within the fansubbing world, and
also in competition with licensed distributors.

a. Miscellaneous Features

As discussed earlier in this Part IV, fansub groups
often provide cultural and translation notes in fansub
translations as a miscellaneous feature not offered in
licensed translated versions of the work. A licensed
version, however, has the ability to offer additional
incentives such as “commentary tracks, still photos . . .
interviews, and collectible packaging.” In a market
dynamic, depending on the desires of fans, the features

112. For instance, the exclusive licensed distributor
and publisher of Korean television drama programming
in North America, YA Entertainment LLC, has shared
through its CEO, Tom Larsen, that its decision to license
television dramas in North America is based on: “[R]equests we receive from Korean TV drama ‘fans’ via
email. We collect all the email requests, count them up,
and rank them. When we receive a certain number of
requests, our licensing team approaches the applicable TV
production studios in Korea to get the USA distribution
rights. From time to time a production studio will ask us
to release some of their other titles as part of a ‘package
deal’. So in those small cases we also release titles that
are not necessarily driven by customer requests.” E-mail
from Tom Larsen, CEO YA Entertainment, to LaToya
Lang, (April 13, 2010, 03:39 PM. EST) (on file with
author).

Anime Online in Light of Current Issues in Copyright Law, in Script-
hatcher.asp (last visited August 29, 2010).

114. See also id. at 529.

115. Id. at 528.
provided by the fansub translation and the licensed translation are valuable miscellaneous features that offer a perspective as to market preferences, especially when considering the costs associated with a licensed television program or movie.

b. Localization

Localization by licensed distributors can also have a market effect on preference for fansub translations versus licensed television programs and movies. The editing of the original foreign television program or movie to adapt to “cultural differences” or “broadcast rules or to obtain a favorable television content rating” leads fans to desire fansub translations as opposed to the licensed content of television programs and movies.

c. Type/Quality of Translation

The various quality and types of translations may also impact the market. Fansub groups and licensed translations may differ in translation styles or idioms used. As a result, fans may have a preference and may migrate to a preferred style.

d. Subbing Techniques and Style

As discussed in Part II, fansub groups use different font styles, graphic techniques, and cultural notes. Fansub groups also gain notoriety for their work these groups may work to trademark and develop some special techniques in this area. Such techniques may impact market trends, as there may be a preference for such characteristics and styles to distinguish tone and has direct implications on the development of licensed translation versions of television programs and movies.

e. Sound Work

The quality of sound in a television program or movie may have a higher production value in a licensed television work rather than a version provided by fansub groups since access is not limited to copies from television. Foreign television programs and movies also produce original music soundtracks and scores—which are desired by many fans. In a market dynamic, the licensed television program or movie may have an advantage over fansub translations when sound quality for both picture and musical composition are applied.

f. Picture Quality

Fansub translations and licensed television programs and movies can both produce DVD quality standard merchandise. Licensed distributors have more resources to reflect the quality of not only the picture, but the translations as well. The overall picture quality enhances the marketability of a television program or movie. Licensed distributors can have the ability to create direct implications on market dynamics; however, the extent of influence is limited to only licensed television programs or movies that are produced.

g. Timing of Release

The timing of release of a foreign television program or movie can impact a market dynamic. Licensed distributors may delay the release date of a foreign work by several months after it has aired in the country of origin. Through fansub translations, fans are able to see the television program or movie within a few hours or days after it has originally aired in its country of origin. A delay in timing, when there is a high demand for the program or movie, can impact its marketability when other means of accessibility is available. Another market dynamic to consider is the relationship of artists and distributors, their respective bargaining powers and the language constraints. Distributors of foreign works are often held to the requirements of artists, sponsors, actors, and actresses and their staff. Moreover, distributors may not be allowed to engage in negotiations regarding foreign marketability since the entertainment industry in some countries is based on contract clauses among the agents of actresses and actors or channels in which they work. The unequal bargaining power of foreign distributors presents difficulty in participating in the global market with respect to their television programs and movies, and has direct implications on access to their television programs and movies abroad. When considering market dynamics, one must also consider the language barriers of foreign artists and distributors. Artists and distributors may not be fluent or conversant

116. Id. at 529.
117. Id.
118. Id.
119. See also id.
120. Id.
121. Id.
122. Id.
123. Id.
124. Id.
125. Daniels, supra note 58 at 718-727.
126. See also Daniels, supra note 58, at 718-727 (specifically discussing the market failure implications on behalf of the author due to lack of information, bargaining power and negotiation dynamics, and externalities on behalf of third parties).
in the language of other countries. As a result, they are unaware of the popularity of their particular program and are often unskilled in proper translation techniques that would allow them to better negotiate the licenses of use for their television programs and movies. Interaction within the global market without the intersession of a translator presents difficulties and creates disadvantages and non-incentives for participation by foreign authors and distributors.

The market analysis of fair use suggests that fansub translations can challenge the marketability of licensed television programs and movies since there are certain aspects that present areas of direct competition. There are, however, certain components of licensed television programs and movies that are not easily duplicated by fansub translations. The quality and various styles of translations may also have implications on what substantially impacts the market. Considering the various factors and elements presented, based on the market analysis and the varying degrees of fansub translations, the marketability of a fansub translation should be determined on an individual case-by-case basis, and given greater deference if there is no accessible licensed version of the television program or movie. The examination may not warrant a fair use in favor of fansub translations, but the analysis should consider whether a feasible alternative of the television program or movie exists beyond a fansub translation.

5. Fair Use: In Conclusion

There are valid arguments for allowing fansub translations under the doctrine of fair use. Because fair use analysis is a copyright infringement defense, fansub translations may overcome this hurdle under copyright law, but cannot overcome other legal considerations with respect to the right to translation and the right to reproduction for authors. Fansubbing is a form of piracy activity. The act of illegally downloading television programs or movies through digisubbing or distributing through peer-to-peer (P2P) networking files or in other formats is considered “the next big craze in illegal file sharing.” Inevitably, the activities of many fansub groups will always be at the opposing end of compliance with copyright law. Therefore, a new model of reform must be introduced to protect the needs of fansub groups while balancing and protecting the interests of artists.

V. The Societal Model for Copyright Reform

Fansub translations are not the only source of access to foreign television programs and movies. Licensed television programs and movies are in the market. Accessibility of a particular television program and movie, however, will vary depending on region, and will lag in timely distribution compared to the country in which it originally aired. Delayed access to foreign television programs and movies reduces the value of an interactive world dialogue that is provided by fansub translations. Although fansubbing does not fit within the modern interpretation of copyright law as an acceptable practice, the continuing expansion of language tools and increasing access to television programs and movies will continue. This growth in global communication and access capabilities means the prevalence of fansub translations and fansub groups will not diminish.

A. Web 2.0 and Beyond: Advances in Translating Venues and Access

Progress in technology has allowed for greater ease and availability for fansub translations to expand in a variety of mediums. The advent of online machine translation tools, torrents, peer-to-peer networking technology and online streaming sites, have contributed to this growth, and will enhance its developments over time.

Machine translation is the method by which a computer translates one language into another language through a series of computer processes and procedures. Technical advances have created a new method of access to methods for translating text in a variety of forms. As a result of these new tools and resources, translation and accessibility to foreign works is even more prevalent. Moreover, through translation tools, fans are now able to connect with their interests on a local level, explore more background on their favorite foreign celebrities, and increase exposure to other television program or movie projects the actor or actress may be working on.

Technology standards have also increased the use of torrents through peer-to-peer networking. A

127. Hatcher, supra note 116 at 526.
torrent is a file sent through a P2P file sharing protocol, otherwise known as BitTorrent. 131 To use BitTorrent, a BitTorrent client must also be used. 132 Online streaming sites have also made fansub translations accessible. Online streaming sites provide an alternative to downloading torrents, as individuals now have the ability to view a television program or movie from a website online. As interest in foreign television programs and movies expands, online streaming sites will continue to emerge. 133

A new model of fansub translations has emerged that is not considered illegal and complies with existing copyright law by obtaining appropriate permission from artists and distributors prior to its public distribution. Online streaming viewership of television programs and movies, which provide fansub translations from fansub groups, are now available. 134 Copyright law compliant websites such as, Dramafever and Crunchyroll, offer English subtitled television programs with proper legal permission. 135 The Korean Broadcasting System (KBS), which is South Korea’s largest television network, has also launched an American online viewing station known as KBSWORLDi. 136 The television programs provided through KBSWORLDi are current shows in South Korea that Americans can purchase based on a point system. 137 As Dramafever, Crunchyroll and KBSWORLDi have modeled, there are ways to channel the use of technological advances that would provide protection under copyright law and allow cultural educational opportunities. A majority of fansub groups, however, are not copyright law compliant, and still engage in activity that is a violation of copyright law.

2. Carving out Protection for Fansubbing

Though a majority of fansubbing activity violates copyright law, it brings educational and global market exposure to foreign television programs and movies. The social benefits that result from fansubbing activities outweigh any of the potential damages that could emerge because of copyright infringement and should entitle the activity to some form of protection under copyright law. This form of protection, fansubbing nullification, 138 would engender market growth distribution for foreign television programs and movies where it is currently lacking from a worldwide standpoint. Fansubbing nullification provides protection for fansub groups by ignoring the activity as a violation of copyright law, and instead relies on its benefits of providing educational value and global market exposure. 139

In order to obtain basic fansubbing protection, fansubbers must reaffirm a commitment to their ethos. Fansubbers must uphold a standard of non-commercialism, and if a television program or movie occupies the market, the fansub group must respectively remove all access to the licensed television program or movie immediately and place notifications on their website requiring consumers to destroy all copies and to support the licensed versions.

The creation of a notice of use 139 method not only ensures protection for authors, but also carves out protection for fansub groups that provide timely distribution of foreign television programs and movies. The notice of use method creates a translation right and allows fansub groups to have a form of copyright protection, yet also protects the rights of authors. The

132. See id.
134. See id.
137. Each television program episode is allocated a certain number of points to watch, or a standard package amount to watch the entire series. Americans are able to choose how many points they want to buy based on a standard amount or based according to their television viewing preference.

139. See Nathaniel T. Noda, Copyrights Retold: How Interpretive Rights Foster Creativity and Justify Fan-Based Activities, 20 Seton Hall J. Sports & Ent. L. 131, 142 (2010) (providing a similar discussion based on “interpretive rights.” “When an author places his or her original creative work in the stream of public consciousness, he or she implicitly cedes to the public certain rights of interpretation.”) See also Daniels, supra note 58 at 726-743, (discussing an anime compulsory license); Lisa A. Zakolski, J.D., §199 Obtaining license to publish translation, 18 Am Jur 2d Copyright and Literary Property §199 (discusses that a contracting state of the UCC “may pass legislation providing that if an author fails to publish or authorize the publication of a translation of the author’s work into the language in general use in the contracting state may obtain an nonexclusive license to publish such translation if he or she meets certain requirements”). The goal of this comment is not to require fansub groups to obtain a license, since licensing would create a cost component and legitimate fansub translations are nonprofit.
notice of use would require all fansub groups to send to television networks, producers, or artists of a respective television program or movie, a notice of use that specifies the intent to translate the prospective program or movie. The notice of use must be sent in the original language of the country of origin of television program or movie. The purpose and goal of this method is to place individuals on notice, and allow an informal right of translation. The notice of use should be sent as soon as possible upon the development of an interest in subbing the television program or movie, preferably prior to its public airing date. By having this formal notice, broadcasters, producers and artists are aware of which programs or movies are being subbed, and can evaluate the potential for licensing interests abroad.

The notice of use for a translation right can be provided to fansub groups in a variety of circumstances. For example, allowing fansub groups to have translation and downloading rights to a television program or movie until the artist chooses to provide a translation, or, the artist may choose not to provide a translation, and instead rely solely on the use of the fansub translation as the translated version of the work. Through this method, if authors, producers and television networks want to expand to the online viewing model, similar to the model utilized by Dramafever, they have tools and resources from individuals who could assist in providing quality translations services that fans enjoy.

There are arguments in opposition to this notice of use concept. The main argument opposing this concept is that the method that drives this notice of use concept of fansubbing nullification is the cause of the problem: one must blatantly disobey the canons of copyright law to comply with this theory. Moreover, carving out such an explicit exception for fansubbing may create a chilling effect on new types of media that may also want explicit protection against copyright infringement liability. Any new media type that desires to obtain protection against copyright infringement must, like fansub translations, go through the fair use analysis. Overall, the benefits of protecting a new media type, including the social considerations (educational value, cultural representation, access to the work and localization), must outweigh the potential harm against the original work.

VI. Conclusion: Piercing the Veil of Translation and Culture

Copyright law takes great care in protecting the needs of the author, but does not take into account the needs of the consumer. Televisiion programs and movies have been eschewed merely as forms of entertainment. Although they are entertaining; television programs and movies are a vehicle to understand the “culture, society, and all else human in the world’s industrial economies.” Globalization is not defined by tangible borders. The internet has forged a new medium to accessing world culture. Fansub translations continue to spread the notion of globalization in an entertaining and educational setting.

Under existing copyright law, fansub group practices may commit two wrongs—copyright infringement (if not subject to the defense of fair use) and piracy. The framework, however, of copyright law should be fluid and adapt to the needs of not only the author, but also to the consumer. Fan-based activities are a strong consumer desire. Specifically, among these fan-based activities is fansubbing. Though fansubbing has been cultivated as a wrong, copyright law has the tools to formulate it into a positive, legal activity. In an era plagued by terrorism, building a bridge to new cultural understandings is an important endeavor.

My favorite line of all time was through a fansub translation of a Korean television drama. Although there may have been literal context that was lost in translation, the context of the final English version still resonated with me and in my memory. Perhaps there are other great lines out there that I may want to add to my repertoire. Through fansubbing, I have the ability. This ability is stifled under current copyright law. Copyright law needs to offer protection to fansubbing. It is only then that society as a whole evolves and appreciates the world in which we all live in.

140. Dramafever uses subs that have been translated by WithS2 Fansubs group.